

**Minutes**

85th Meeting of the Joint Advisory Committee for the Improvement of Air Quality in the Ciudad Juárez, Chihuahua / El Paso, Texas / Doña Ana County, New Mexico Air Basin

| <b>Hybrid Meeting: February 16, 2023</b>                   |   |
|--|---|
| JAC Members Attending (*Alternate ** Not Present, virtual) |   |
| U.S.   | México  |
| Guy Donaldson, US EPA                                      | Daniel López Vicuña, SEMARNAT                           |
| David Ramirez, TCEQ (virtual)                              | *Lili González, PROFEPA                                 |
| Armando Paz, NMED (virtual)                                | **COESPRIS  |
| C. David Harris, City of Las Cruces (virtual)              | *Melissa Zambrano, SDUE de Chihuahua                    |
| Jason Sarate, City of El Paso (virtual)                    | Brenda Nava, CANACINTRA Juárez                          |
| *John Moore, Freeport-McMoRan Copper and Gold (virtual)    | Lic. César Díaz, Dirección de Ecología de Ciudad Juárez |
| Larry Olsen, DrPH, Citizen (virtual)                       | *Ing. Alberto Nicolas López, IMIP                       |
| Alberto Correa, Capítulo Paso del Norte                    | Rene Franco, Franco y Asociados                         |
| *Dave DuBois, NMSU (virtual)                               | Dra. Alba Yadira Corral, UACJ                           |
| Wen-Whai Li, Ph.D., P.E., UTEP (virtual)                   | *Fernando Ortiz, NADB                                   |
| Claudia Valles, El Paso MPO (virtual)                      |   |
| Carlos A Rincón, US EPA - Liaison                          | Biól. Gerardo Tarín, SEMARNAT- Liaison                  |
| Eugenia (Gina) Posada, TCEQ - Liaison                      |   |

**Copresident Daniel López from SEMARNAT opened the meeting and introduced the Mayor of Ciudad Juárez.**

**Atty. César Díaz of the Municipal Ecology Department on behalf of Mayor of Ciudad Juárez, Honorable Cruz Pérez** gave welcoming remarks. He stated how important the meeting was as it was the first in-person meeting in Ciudad Juárez since the COVID-pandemic began. A virtual link was provided as well. The last in-person meeting took place in Las Cruces, NM in 2019. He was proud to welcome everyone in the shared commitment to the improvement of the environment, and for Ciudad Juárez to represent the state of Chihuahua in this basin and the commitments be carried out in an optimal way. In addition to the agreements that are made in this meeting, he remained committed to give due compliance, as well as Mayor

Cruz Pérez Cuellar. He stated the JAC has their commitment and interest in improving the environment on the border.

**Welcoming Remarks and Message from Guy Donaldson from USEPA** he stated having the great privilege to introduce TCEQ Commissioner Bobby Janecka. He stated Commissioner Janecka has been a great supporter of the JAC and a leader in recognizing joint challenges of the two nations and the multiple states along the border.

**TCEQ Commissioner Bobby Janecka** participated virtually due to the legislative session in progress and thanked Mayor Cruz Pérez Cuellar for his hospitality and everyone for their participation in the first in-person meeting of the JAC since 2019. He was honored to participate and looked forward to engaging in conversations and sharing ideas. The inauguration of the new monitoring station marked a significant milestone of the now fully operational binational fund created in 2021 and is a good omen for things to come. He recognized the effort by all contributing institutions, especially those who are part of the Binational Fund Committee, the Administrative Unit and the NADB. He stated it is exceptional to find a group of committed individuals such as the JAC that through hard work and consistency go beyond good intentions. The JAC has invested their time and capabilities to making their communities better and the air quality cleaner. He is glad the binational workshop data quality systems is underway. The workshop will continue tomorrow in El Paso including participation from key US and Mexican institutions. The objective is to improve understanding between US/MX authorities regarding quality assurance and control procedures, to build our shared technical knowledge, promote the exchange of experiences and practices and provide feedback on QA/QC procedures of the Juárez Network. While QA/QC might not seem technical, and not easily communicable, it is integral to holding the trustworthy data on which the public and policy makers rely. Air quality improvements require a comprehensive approach, and its wide-ranging monitoring is an important element but only a starting point. Public participation and recognition by community members it is key to promoting democratic air quality governance. As such, he urged participants to closely follow the proposal that Eddie Moderow will later propose regarding the binational air quality excellence award to recognize organizations and/or individuals that have made significant contributions to improvement of air quality in the region. He has witnessed the strengthening of the JAC in the increased activity of the subcommittees and members and is proud of the unlikely partnership that transcends borders and jurisdictions towards a common goal. He thanked everyone attending the meeting.

Copresident Donaldson thanked Commissioner Janecka for his remarks and Ciudad Juárez for hosting the meeting.

Copresident López reminded everyone that the agenda was provided and to please vote for approval. He mentioned adding two topics of “E” and “F” to the agenda, presentations by Hugo Landa and comments by M. Olivia Rivera.

### **Approval of Agenda and Previous Meeting Minutes**

Copresident López moved the motion to approve the agenda and all approved.

Ms. Posada noted the approval of minutes occurred via email by all JAC voting members. Carlos Rincón mentioned there were 11 members present and needed the virtual count to have quorum.

Gina Posada reported nine US voting members participating virtually. This made quorum for an official meeting.

### **Public Comments**

Alberto Jaramillo appreciated the opportunity to speak in front of the Honorable Cruz Pérez Cuellar, Mayor of Ciudad Juárez and in front of this council. He is a member of the Sunland Park, New Mexico City Council; he did not come representing the city, but as a citizen to speak on behalf of the constituents of the district regarding the nearby landfill. There was a time when the landfill was removed from everything and everyone. Yet today it is surrounded by homes, near two schools in New Mexico and a high school on the Mexican side. He asked for ideas as this transcends borders and affects air quality on both sides of the border and in the three sister cities. What worries us all is that the emissions already cross the border of the two countries and the three sister cities, El Paso, Texas, Ciudad Juárez, Chihuahua, and Sunland Park, New Mexico. He made himself available to listen and learn from experts present in this room, and he finalized his comments with thanking everyone for the opportunity to be there.

### **Discussion of Public Comments & JAC Member Comments**

Copresident López invited all to visit the JAC website where agendas and other information can be found.

Dr. Gabriel Ibarra Mejia of UTEP mentioned that he is the coleader for the Environmental Task Force on Border 2025 and that he is willing to work with Mr. Jaramillo on the aforementioned challenge.

Copresident Donaldson mentioned this was his first-time hearing about Mr. Jaramillo's challenge, but he will investigate further once he speaks with the appropriate waste disposal divisions to learn more about the situation. He thanked Mr. Jaramillo for bringing this challenge to the attention of the JAC.

Copresident López invited Ecology Director César Díaz to introduce the Councilwoman.

César Díaz introduced Alma Arredondo, President of Ecology and Civil Protection

Alma Arredondo, coordinator of the Ecology and Civil Protection Commission in Ciudad Juárez City Hall, made herself available and thanked everyone.

Copresident Donaldson introduced Dr. Carlos Rincón.

### **[Air Quality Report for the Paso del Norte](#) by Dr. Carlos Rincón, USEPA**

Virtually – Claudia Valles of the MPO asked how is the new proposed standard will impact the basin.

Copresident Donaldson mentioned that the current standard is at 12, but the new proposed range would be between 9 -10 micrograms /per meter cubed. The new standard is still in the proposal stage, and the EPA is taking public comment on this topic. The US standard does not have a legal impact in México. When the EPA issues a new standard, the process required by the New Clean Air Act is to ask the states (in this case Texas and New Mexico) for their recommendations regarding which areas within their states area attainment or non-attainment. After EPA receives those recommendations, then EPA promulgates the areas as officially 'attainment' or 'non-attainment'. Depending on how low the standard is set and how high the PM levels are, it is possible that some or all of the El Paso/Doña Ana County areas could become non-attainment. With a non-attainment designation, the states have to come up with State Implementation Plans (SIP) to address the problem and get the area back into attainment. It is too early to change plans: we would have to look at all the sources of pollution and with the dry climate and high winds (those are not controllable) and consider exceptional events. The EPA

will look at the latest health studies and the comments from the public to set a standard required by law that protects public health with an adequate margin of safety.

Michael Baca of NMED (virtually) asked to look at the PM<sub>2.5</sub> slide on the Design Value (DV), following on Claudia's question. What are the DVs in Paso del Norte now in relation to the new proposed standard. He also expressed interest in the ozone data for El Paso, wondering about the decline in El Paso DV's over the past two years and increase in DV's in New Mexico. He stated it would be interesting to explore the divergence in the monitoring data.

Copresident Donaldson mentioned that the new proposed standard would probably put the area in question as non-attainment.

Michael Baca mentioned that the new standard would put New Mexico in non-attainment.

Jason Sarate City of El Paso (virtually) asked why there was no data from Ciudad Juárez, and if the EPA considers the binational airshed when designating a new PM 2.5 standard.

Copresident Donaldson mentioned that when EPA does designations under the Clean Air Act it is required to review monitoring data without consideration of international emissions. There is a provision of the Clean Air Act that the EPA can look up emissions for an area after the designations are made and provide relief from requirements on the public and industry area, if the area cannot attain because of international emissions. This has been done in the El Paso area in regard to ozone with the 1hr standard, as the area would have reached attainment if not for the international emissions. The area would of attain for the 1hr standard but did not for international emissions. We have petitions from both states to take a look at the region, which the EPA is currently evaluating those.

Michael Baca (virtually) requested an investigation on why the Ozone DV is dropping in El Paso. Is it due to emissions reductions or something else?

Copresident Donaldson mentioned he does not have an answer for that at the moment.

David DuBois (virtually) mentioned he would also would like to heighten the priority on this topic.

Eddie Moderow mentioned that it merits looking into.

Alba Corral suggested reviewing the difference by the number of cars that are circulating in NM, and whether the increase in population size might be increasing ozone.

Jaime Contreras, an air quality consultant, asked about the nature of Ciudad Juárez, a desert area, and how exceptional events get evaluated. He is concerned that we might be missing possible big sources of PM emissions, such as land development. He stated that because PM gets airborne quickly due to the wind we might not be enforcing measurements of control to mitigate these emissions. Nature is always playing a game but there is also an anthropogenic factor. He asked how the EPA protocol takes exceptional events into account.

Copresident Donaldson mentioned that these points are well taken, and exceptional events are challenging.

Copresident López proposed to have a space in the agenda for the next meeting to discuss this challenge and the possibility of having an emissions inventory for the entire air basin

**[Air Quality Assessment: International Bridge of the Americas \(BOTA\), El Paso](#) by Dr. Henry Van, UTEP (virtually)**

Briselda Duarte mentioned that this is a project of binational coordination selected by Border 2025 and the final results will be presented to the JAC.

Brenda Nava asked if the study would evaluate the bridge crossings that take a long time on both sides. She asked if personnel will be increase to give access from Mexico to the United States and open lines so that they can cross faster from the United States to Mexico.

Briselda Duarte commented that the study contains several sections that begin with the emissions inventory. From there, the fact is to highlight if there is any critical point in coordination with all entities, it is planned to make recommendations where there is a mitigation measure. She mentioned wanting to combine health, traffic, emissions and all that together with the regulatory study. Seeing the rules and seeing any impact, we are going to take it to consensus.

Copresident López invited all to visit the JAC website where agendas and other information can be found.

Copresident Donaldson introduced César Díaz and Melissa Zambrano.

**New Air Quality Monitoring Station in Ciudad Juárez by Atty César Díaz, Ecology Department and M. Sc. Melissa Zambrano, SDUE**

César Díaz, Ecology Department Director, mentioned that the responsibilities of his department have changed a great deal, and it is now responsible for enforcing animal welfare, that is a situation that can affect the environment. A new administration began on 2021, the reality is that the stations were in very bad condition due to COVID -19, as it was difficult to access them. I thank the Councilwoman at the Commission who found funds to hire a company that would help us with the maintenance of these stations, Oct. 11, 2021 marked the inauguration of the vehicle verification (inspection) center which is the largest in the city, the center also contains a particulate monitor. In November 2022, it was possible to rehabilitate the Canales Lira Monitoring station, the trailer, the green area around it. He also reported that the Ecology Department will no longer be located at the City Hall, as they have obtained funding for a new office space. In two- to three-months the Ecology Dept. will move to a larger area around the Chamizal, which was previously used for public transport. The Ecology Dept. will share the building with SEMARNAT. The Ecology Dept. will start with clean points in the city, meaning that citizens can dispose of waste such as electronics, oils, batteries, and expired medicines, even when there are already collections centers in the community center. They are copying and modifying methods used in other states. He reported asking the Ecology Commission to change the name of the Ecology Department, to the Environment and Ecology Department or vice versa. The Ecology Dept. is pleased to have a new monitoring station which was made possible through the efforts of the EPA, TCEQ, SEMARNAT, INECC, SEDUE, the Marathon Foundation, and the UACJ. When it is said that, if this trailer is granted to the municipality they took on the task of having the facilities at 100 completion. We will be very aware that they continue like this, they know that it is in a somewhat complicated area of the city, but they are in the best commitment and coordination with everyone who has to do this. This new station will measure PM<sub>2.5</sub> using a meteorological tower that will also measure wind direction and speed,

and temperature. UACJ also installed a ceilometer to measure concentrations of aerosols within the atmosphere such as solid, fine and polluting matter. He apologized for the technical difficulties that occurred and sent an invite to participants for the inauguration of the new office. He reported the continuation of the vehicle verification program; stating that the public has a bad concept of it, but that it is only to verify which sector these vehicles are polluting.

Melissa Zambrano of SDUE thanked everyone for the information presented thus far. December 1, 2021 the Binational Air Quality Fund received the contribution from Marathon Petroleum Foundation for this station. On February 2, 2022 the Fund Committee, in its fourth session, unanimously authorized that the contribution be used for the installation of a new station. It will include an ozone analyzer, automatic equipment, and the parameter for meteorological monitoring that the Ecology Director mentioned. Throughout 2022, different points were discussed for the location and the UACJ clinic was chosen. Including this station, there will be five stations in Ciudad Juárez reporting online data to the National Air Quality Information System (SINAICA), four from the Binational Fund and one from UACJ. She stated that SDUE continues to increase these monitoring networks to have databases with information that can be useful to search for strategies and policies to reduce pollution that concerns us today. By means of the Fund, they will conduct an evaluation of the stations that are already in existence to see if their location is still feasible or whether they will need to be moved, and if it is possible to increase the number. There is also the possibility of allotting funds to improve the stations because some do not have certain functions.

Copresident López introduced Dr. Gabriel Ibarra Mejia.

### **Effects of Dust Storm Exposure on Hospital Admissions for Genitourinary Systems Diseases in El Paso by Dr. Gabriel Ibarra Mejia, UTEP**

Briselda Duarte asked what was the sample size and if they have a map of sampling sites.

Dr. Gabriel Ibarra answered the study used 230,000 cases of data from the State of Texas Health Dept. but the map was not added to the presentation. Dr. Ibarra reported they are working on correlations with Midland and Lubbock, as they are in the same situation. We are very interested in the Valley Fever prevalence and studying those parameters.

Dr. Adrián Vázquez commented that the presentation was very interesting. He asked about the route of exposure and/or metabolization of these contaminants and their effect on very specific organs. He also asked what would be your opinion or reaction to the possibility that there was a correlation with finer particles; when there is a dust storm the distribution, curve is pronounced with the majority being large particles. The smaller fractions also increase however, and studies of ultrafine particle pollution is typically associated with neuronal problems. This could also be something worth exploring.

Dr. Ibarra replied that they have explored it but due to time constraints and restrictions, he did not present it here. In fact, they studied most of the pollutants that are regulated in the state of Texas. Our extensive study is based on all contaminants; ultra-fine particles can be measure and it is a personal interest of mine. We are not presenting everything, as we will be continuing our research. The hypothesis is that dust storms increase the risk of exacerbation of chronic conditions.

Olivia Rivera asked if an analysis of the composition of the particle samples has been considered to identify the way in which this relationship is related to the cases seen.

Dr. Ibarra replied that they have contemplated all this. Right now, they are doing the identification in the process as a risk assessment, apparently the risk is here, what follows is to measure the exposure, the routes of exposure and characterize the risk. On the team we have geologists, health scientists, particle physicists, and biologists who are taking care of the funds to apply to make the composition of the samples.

Question, the speciation you are doing could identify the source, if there is a means that creates it, and what would be the step to control that source. Since a monitoring network is being established, there would be a specialized team to do that kind of monitoring, and really control those emissions. And for 18 months of pandemic that we were in confinement, with many wearing face masks there was some change in the reaction to the dust storms.

Dr. Ibarra thanked everyone for their questions and answered the first one. The most difficult step is to be specific in identifying the source, especially because of the region where we live. Of course, we can assume that now that the emissions inventories are going to be carried out, we can identify hot spots that could contribute to the total, but the geographical area where we live is difficult to characterize. There are no standardized methodologies to characterize everything we want to identify, in fact, one of the proposals is to find how to measure coccidian fungi in the environment, which is a bit complicated. In relation to the dust storms, the pattern continues, they did not change. It is good to cover your mouth/nose so as not to expose yourself to the air. Now there is a little more awareness.

Copresident López shortened the break due to technical challenges starting the meeting.

## **10 Minute Break**

**[Environmental Education and Air Quality in Communities West of Ciudad Juárez](#) by Dr. Adrián F. Vázquez, UACJ  
(No questions)**

**[National Emissions Inventory: the Case of Ciudad Juárez Municipality](#) by Hugo Landa, SEMARNAT**

Dr. Vázquez asked if the new inventory, with the stated improvements, is comparable to the ProAires to see if there has been an evolution by sector in terms of emissions.

Hugo Landa replied that they are basing themselves on five methodologies that have been established as valid. The parts of fixed sources continue to use the source monitoring. Obviously, there is a validation, for example, I have a boiler of two hundred with its operation, the fuel can only operate a certain amount of fuel. The part of movable sources has changed a lot, now a model called Moves is used. At this moment we are finishing upgrading, that would be a little more difficult to compare. But as in some of these, if we have the information to make a new run, it would be important and take hard work to make them comparable. In daily sources we have already generated emissions factors of our own. For example, the content of paints in the country is a little higher than the content of paints in coops in the United States and it grows a little, this factor, for example, has these contents and 8 years ago, up to that period you could go back. A period further back we would have to take the characteristics of these coatings from the technical sheets of that time. We continue to use the natural part, using a model called base because it is the level of information that we can generate, it seems to me that it is the most important part. There can be comparability if we readjust some of the variables.

Eddie Moderow stated how important an emissions inventory would be for Paso del Norte, opening it up to New México, Chihuahua, and Texas. One single government would not do that but to contract to a third party: e. g. maybe North American Development Bank. It would be so useful to have this information.

Hugo Landa answered it would be a great idea to have information for both countries. The measurements that are going to be at the crossing are fantastic and will help a lot. It would be timely and specific data to what is happening at the international bridge. That is great news.

Copresident López stated that what Hugo Landa presented with 2018 Inventory is somewhat preliminary because we are still waiting for results from mobile sources, and they already have some progress for the 2020 results. As for the basin we could define together with the stakeholders present what would be the best year to determined. Also, to see if NADB supports us to be able to do the job. A collaboration at the basin/municipality level, we could detail more information in the national statistics, since those details that are available at the local level are not seen.

Hugo Landa mentioned a workshop that will be held on May 23-24 with EPA personnel for the border states to discuss details of the inventory. They reviewed a while ago, and we did quite well. They found some important points that we have discussed As Daniel says, the participation of the municipalities is essential to gathering more detailed information.

Armando Paz (virtually) asked about the reduction of NOX in Ciudad Juárez. Roughly 40 thousand tons per year of NOX was seen in 2017, while 2018 showed 32 thousand. What was the main emission reduction that accounted for 20% reduction of NOX in 2017-18.

Hugo Landa mentioned that the NOX concentration depends on other variables. There we could see some production data, for example, or power generation to find out how the consumption of some of the fuels behaved.

Copresident Donaldson introduced Olivia Rivera Hernández.

### **State of Ciudad de México Air Quality Monitoring Network by M. Olivia Rivera Hernández**

Olivia Rivera Hernández gave a perspective on the problem in the Valley Basin of México City. There are approximately 7, 500 square kilometers occupied by 22,000 million people. She informed the committee that 7 million vehicles circulate the area every day, with 6.3 million homes, 2000 industries and 30, 000 registered services. This implies that there is a large amount of emissions entering the atmosphere, but not only that, these emissions finally become criteria pollutants that we measure, but there is also another problem in the valley basin. The basin is at an elevation of 2400 meters above sea level, with a closed basin at three of its ends and this prevents the free passage of wind. We have high solar radiation most of the year. Above all, at the time that we call the hot dry, which are the months of March to June, where the levels of solar radiation are very high and the production of ozone pollutant is reflected. It is when we reach the highest levels of ozone and that sometimes exceed 155 parts per million that the authorities decree an environmental contingency in the Valley of México. Another problem that we have are the fine particles of PM 2.5 and 10 caused by dust storms, just like in the Paso del Norte basin. In the case of PM 2.5 we have also decreed environmental contingencies for this pollutant, especially in the festivities of Christmas and New Year, this is due to the burning of the fireworks. Curiously, we declare an environmental contingency which is applied the next day when everyone is resting from the night's festivities. Our contingency program is under review.



The atmospheric monitoring system (SMA) covers 50% of the Valley of México. The atmospheric monitoring systems covers approximately 3,500 square kilometers. We have 44 stations to measure air quality divided into automatic stations that report criteria pollutants every hour and in turn report the air quality index. We have 28 weather stations, 16 for weather storage. We are the only monitoring network that has atmospheric measurement. We have 11 stations where we measure the concentration of suspended particles in different sizes (PM 10, 2.5, PST), because PST is measure, because the NOM for Lead is required to evaluate this contaminant by measuring total suspended particles. SMA in the Valley of México has been operating without interruption since 1986, providing air quality every hour for the 22 million people who live there. A system that has become essential for air quality management in the Valley of México. Thanks to this system, we can disseminate the index, alert the city of high concentrations, we can evaluate how the levels of pollutants are behaving based on the public policies that are applied to improved air quality. This led us to the fact that in these 30 years of measurement we have reduced between 30 and 90 percent the concentration of some of the criteria pollutants. The in the ambient air one that has had the least reduction is ozone. The one that has had a greater reduction of more than 90% is sulfur dioxide due to the pressure exerted by the population and the local government. There are two governments that are in the Valley of México with the federal authorities to be able to have cleaner gasoline. In yesterday's talk, I was mentioning the quality control and assurance that we need when operating these monitoring instruments, which is fundamental. The information that we provide is used to carry out health studies, as Dr. Gabriel Ibarra mentioned, in addition to research of other kinds. Most importantly it shows that people trust that what we are doing and that we are doing. The homologation of these criteria in the case of El Paso, between the Mexican side and the United States, the measurement between them may be comparable. We must measure in the same way to be able to make this comparison. I commend the effort of the authorities to be able to standardize these measurements and am very grateful for the invitation to share the experience in the Valley of México.

Copresident Donaldson appreciated the participation.

A member of the Public congratulated the speaker and recommender the committee stop being reactive, stating that we are many years behind schedule and we can be proactive at the border. He asked her recommendations on how many stations are needed to achieve the objective of taking the necessary measure to act in a short time and reduce all the indicators in the given area. If you tell us that we need 10 stations, then that's what we have to focus on. I am glad that there is one more station but we do not put in the necessary resources, and I am talking about both the public sector and the private sector, because we are going to meet every year and we are going to be exactly the same.

Olivia stated that in order to have monitoring station we would have to carry out studies regarding where it needs to be located and what the need is. I have a master's degree in environmental engineering and my master's thesis was the location of PM2.5 monitoring stations, so this is a job that took a year of study. We placed 84 measurement points to be able to identify the best sites and how this pollutant is distributed in the atmosphere. It is not the only method there is, there are other methods, but those who are in charge of the monitoring stations and the operation know what they have to do. In my case, it's the first time I've come to Ciudad Juárez, so I could not say more about it. What is important about this is that we all participate in the air quality problem. It is important that the government puts up surveillance and warning monitoring stations, but all the research studies that are being done right now to understand what the problem really is and where these contaminants are coming from and also important. But the population also has a large contribution in this regard. We check our cars, we keep our

home in good condition, which means our heater, our stove, which generate hydrocarbons that are reactive and generate ozone. Here the contribution has to be from everyone, and dissemination of information is needed to understand where the contaminant is coming from and how it is produced so that we can address the issue from home.

### **Signing of Border 2025 Program Agreement to Municipality of Juárez Integrated Solid Waste Management for Juárez's Landfill.**

The Honorable Mayor Cruz Pérez Cuellar attended a signing of the agreement within Border 2025 program for a project that funds through the North American Development Bank by EPA for the municipality of Ciudad Juárez.

Salvador López Córdova thanked the Mayor for his time and hospitality. The project, Plan for the Preparation of Comprehensive Waste Management of the Municipality of Ciudad Juárez, takes place within the framework of Border 2025 sponsored by EPA and SEMARNAT. The main objective is to develop a comprehensive management plan to regulate and order the stages of activities related to the correct management of the waste that enters landfills through to the final destination where reuse, recycling and other processes could be prioritized. The program will have the financial support of \$77,000, and will require a diagnosis of the current status of waste management an analysis of applicable technology, and a financial estimate of the costs for the implementation of said technologies. Finally, the program will need an evaluation of a comprehensive work plan. He thanked and reiterated the pleasure of working with these initiatives.

Mayor Cruz Pérez Cuellar thanked EPA and NADB, Gibrán Director of Sanitation of the Municipal Government. He reiterated that it is great day for Ciudad Juárez in environmental terms. He thanked NADB for all the support, a new air quality monitoring station was inaugurated today. He also thanked Marathon Petroleum Foundation for their support. The tire shredder was also inaugurated and as everyone knows the enormous problem with tires. This was the agreement of the Council. The waste collection contract with PASA, which is going to be 17 years old, expires as does the issue of the landfill. It comes at a very important time to do things well. The waste collection issue will not be given to a single company. A city with 1,600,000 people cannot be placed in the hands of only one company for waste collection, that was a mistake. There are other cities with several companies and this means that if there is a dispute with one, another can take over. With a dispute we would need to get 140 waste collection trucks. They had a talk with NADB about a storm drainage plan and hopefully they can materialize it. Finally, he thanked everyone for the attention and participation.

A group photo was taken:

85<sup>th</sup> JAC meeting in Ciudad Juárez, February 16, 2023 ([photo](#))

Copresident López continued with the subcommittee reports and introduced Oscar Fentanes.

### **Reports from Subcommittees**

**Report from [Binational Air Quality Fund](#)** Oscar Fentanes Copresident of the Binational Fund mentioned that three meetings were held in 2021. In 2022 they applied to obtain more funds from which the purchase is precisely derived, the acquisition of the station that we have been talking about today. There was a visit coordinated by the municipality, SDUE, TCEQ and INECC, we had a proposal for four sites. It was considered at that time what we considered to be the best location. But when observing all these deficiencies in time, another need arises to carry out a technical-scientific study that allows us to evaluate, the representativeness and current coverage of the monitoring stations and where to start a study that will be valid in the next seven

years, how are we going to grow in the basin, where the new stations have to be set up in accordance with the new objectives. We reported the process of requesting new resources to carry out this study. In the past year, the operation and maintenance contract for the three monitoring stations has been kept in force and soon they want to authorize manuals that are closely linked to the maintenance and operation of monitoring stations. This will strengthen the quality and control and assurance program. At the end of the year, the idea arose to carry out a workshop to exchange experience and knowledge gained from the meetings yesterday. The INECC, which would carry out this eight-month study, is participating directly and contributing 15% of the total cost of the study, which leads us to obtain the remaining 85%. \$250,000 has been received, and he thanks NADB for their support. The activities for 2022 are also about to be approved and in the chat, you will be able to see the link to consult the minutes of the Binational Fund. He thanked Sergio Vasquez for all the support and collaboration.

Eddie Moderow introduced Isabel Keddy Hector, Border Affairs intern virtually presented a proposal.

Ms. Keddy Hector greeted everyone. She is a graduate student at UT-Austin. She presented a proposal for the Rincón Air Quality Excellence Award for the Paso del Norte Air Basin. This award was created with the idea of celebrating and commemorating individuals and organizations within the Paso del Norte Air Basin for their commitment to air quality excellence. For this award there are four categories for which individuals and organizations can be nominated. First, Reduction- direct or indirect reduction of basin air pollution or pollutant emissions. Second, Innovation - creation or utilization of innovative strategies to improve air quality in the basin. Third, Outreach and Education – regarding air quality within the basin community and lastly, Research – ideas and projects that will expand current knowledge regarding air quality within the basin. The hope is that this award will continue to motivate and celebrate individuals and organizations that demonstrate excellence in these areas. With this award we would like to honor Dr. Carlos Rincón for more than thirty years of dedication to air quality excellence within the Paso del Norte Air Basin. We hope to continue working with this award and in the next JAC meeting pass the resolution.

Copresident López thanked Mr. Moderow for the proposal. He asked if any of the members of the JAC would oppose this award or the name of the award. He requested Dr. Rincón explain the process to get this approval.

Eddie Moderow stated that the states of Chihuahua and Texas will work on the MOU and present a plan for resolution at the next JAC meeting.

Dr. Rincón stated the first step is to form the committee that will give it the current applicability for 2023 and provide all the guidelines for the grant award.

Copresident Donaldson appreciated the proposal from TCEQ. He also requested if there were any additional public comments.

### **Public Comments**

No comments by the public.

### **Highlights and Consensus Items**

Copresident López reminded everyone to return the translations devices. It was a full day meeting, which beginning yesterday with a binational workshop on quality assurance and

control of air quality data. The last in-person meeting was in 2019 in Las Cruces: it was great to see everyone reunited after three years. Like many organizations, the JAC knew how to respond to the pandemic, and were able to work during the pandemic. He thanked the TCEQ for providing the accommodations for the hybrid meeting. Topics for subsequent meetings are ozone levels and the discussion that was held with New México and also the possible PM<sub>2.5</sub> standard reductions and the implications this would have on the Paso del Norte Air Basin. We proposed as Copresidents that a space be opened on the agenda to discuss these topics. Between this session and the next one, New Mexico, Texas and INECC can have a meeting and come to the next JAC meeting with more agreements. The other topic is the proposal made by the TCEQ for the Carlos Rincón award that it be added as a point for the next session, to establish the award. We would appreciate it if TCEQ would share the information presented. The comments of Alberto Jaramillo and the EPA and the support Dr. Gabriel offered, and give follow up. He thanked everyone for such important presentations. He appreciated the technical JAC team, Gina, Sergio and Margarita who translates and speaks in our ears. The team prepares with a great deal of time for all this to flow. He thanked everyone who participated in person and remotely.

Copresident Donaldson thanked Copresident López for running the meeting so efficiently and reaching consensus. He stated it was wonderful to meet in-person again. He still works remotely a great deal, but there is something special about in person meetings. He stated that this was a fruitful meeting and it was exciting to see the ribbon cutting of the new monitor, the quality assurance workshop, and the great deal of work done this week by so many. Questions of the trends in air quality came up, and he wants to see how the committee can figure the issue out as work continues. The excellence award is a great idea to demonstrate the binational cooperation that we have here. He thanked the TCEQ and Gerardo for putting the meeting together and Margarita for the translation service. He thanked everyone who participated in-person and online.

#### **Establish Next Meeting Date and Adjourn-**

Next meeting will be hybrid.

Environmental Services Department at City of El Paso will host the meeting in person and TCEQ will be providing a link for those who would like to attend virtually. The meeting date is for June 15, 2023.

40 participants attended the virtual meeting and 58 participated in the in-person meeting.