

Minutes

67th Meeting of the Joint Advisory Committee for the Improvement of Air Quality in the
Ciudad Juárez, Chihuahua / El Paso, Texas / Doña Ana County, New Mexico Air Basin

**Burrell College of Osteopathic Medicine
3501 Arrowhead Road
Las Cruces, New Mexico**

September 22, 2016

JAC Members Attending (Absences and alternates indicated)	
U.S.	México
Mark Hansen, U.S. EPA	M.I. Ana Patricia Martínez, SEMARNAT
Lorinda Gardner, TCEQ	**Lic. Joel Aranda, PROFEPA
Michael Baca, NMED	**Sr. Eloy Corral Banda, COESPRIS
Jacob Kidd, City of Las Cruces	Lic. Alfredo Ruiz, SEDUE de Chihuahua
Karl Rimkus, City of El Paso	* Lic. Viridiana Vázquez, CANACINTRA Juárez (Alt. Quím. Raúl de la Fuente)
John P. Quinn, FMI	Lic. César René Díaz, Dirección de Ecología de Ciudad Juárez
**Elaine Barron, M.D.	**Ing. Vicente López, IMIP
Alberto Correa, PhD (Remote participation)	**M en C René Franco, Recaudador de Rentas
David Dubois, NMSU	Dra. Alba Y. Corral, UACJ
Wen-Whai Li, Ph.D., P.E., UTEP	*Ing. Joaquin Marrufo, COCEF (Alt. J. T. O'Brien)
Claudia Valles, El Paso MPO	Lic. Brenda Ríos Prieto, SEMARNAT
Carlos A Rincon, US EPA	Biól. Gerardo Tarín, SEMARNAT
* Alternate	** Not Present

Welcome and Introductions

The meeting of the Joint Advisory Committee (JAC) took place at the Burrell College of Osteopathic Medicine in Las Cruces, New Mexico. The co-leaders from Mexico (Ana Patricia Martinez) and the United States (Mark Hansen) attended, as well as a majority of the Mexican and U.S. members, establishing a quorum.

Ana Patricia Martinez began the meeting with a word of appreciation to members and collaborators of JAC which no longer will participate in the Committee:

- Nieves Aurora Maloof Arzola, Secretary of SEDESOL,
- Alfredo Ruíz, Director of Ecology, SEDUE de Chihuahua
- César René Díaz, Director of Ecology, Cd. Juárez
- Sergio Acosta del Val, Regional Deputy Director of SEDUE in Juárez
- Alejandro Siqueiros Falomir, Economic and Border Affairs Consul, Consulate General of Mexico in El Paso.

Alejandro Siqueiros appreciated the accolades and responded by saying that attending the JAC was a very satisfying experience; he is taking a new position with Chihuahua City government. He mentioned that the Consul General of Mexico in the El Paso Office is already looking for a replacement to attend the JAC meetings.

Gina Posada thanked Burrell College of Osteopathic Medicine for providing the venue for this meeting and offered a tour for those who are interested in viewing the building.

There were no comments during the public comments section.

In the member's announcements section, Mark Hansen introduced two new JAC members:

- Jacob Kidd of City of Las Cruces, responsible for environmental compliance and review of erosion control plans
- Claudia Valles, responsible for Rider 7 (formerly Rider 8) at the El Paso Metropolitan Planning Organization

Michael Baca announced that there is a page on the NMED website on re-designation of ozone in southern Doña Ana County. He provided a site where you can learn more about and ask questions about the re-designation process, www.env.nm.gov/aqb/ozone.html

Air Quality Report. Carlos Rincon, EPA

Carlos Rincon presented the air quality report for the Paso del Norte region, reporting air quality data from January through August 2016 (except for carbon monoxide), which includes data from December 2015 through August 2016.

He stated that maps showing locations for the air quality and meteorological monitors could be improved.

In the region only three pollutants are measured, plus hydrogen sulfide emitted by wastewater treatment plants.

During the reporting period no exceedances of carbon monoxide were recorded. One has to consider that in these months CO is not a problem, as it is in winter.

Regarding ozone, the graphs showed the 8 hour average measurements in El Paso and Doña Ana County; six of the monitors are in El Paso and five are in Doña Ana County. The NAAQS was recently revised to 70 ppb. and the fourth highest average has been exceeded, but not by much.

Thanks to the State Implementation Plan (SIP), Rider 8 and other programs, there are fewer exceedances and this also shows they have been successful programs by being in compliance. Also to have worked with the Clean Air Act, the ProAire and the single basin resolution, it allowed the region to stay within the ozone standard.

Regarding the design value for ozone, the graph showed the El Paso ozone design value as 71 ppb for El Paso and 72 ppb for Doña Ana County.

As for PM2.5 particulate matter, the daily average showed no exceedances; the highest value recorded was an exception event caused by high wind conditions on March 12 which in turn caused a high value. As an exceptional event this type of NAAQS exceedance can be exempted and not counted towards the number of exceedances.

For the twenty-four-hour value it showed compliance.

With respect to H2S there has been an increase in the number of exceedances of the state standard with up to 204 days during 2016, where the allowable limit of 80ppb has been exceed.

Finally, Carlos Rincon stated that a new JAC website where all the information will be made public will soon be in operation.

JAC By-Laws and Operating Procedures. *Karl Rimkus, City of El Paso*

Karl Rimkus proposed inviting to the JAC important players that perform a critical role in the regulation of air quality in the region, as is the case of El Paso County, as the County complements efforts made by the City of El Paso to implement pollution control strategies in that jurisdiction and currently does not hold a spot in the committee.

Carlos Rincon observed that county level government does not exist in Mexico and under the JAC statutes, if a member of the U.S. side is added, that requires addition of a member on the Mexican side. This complicates integrating El Paso County in the JAC, would lead to an addendum in Appendix 1 of Annex V of the La Paz Agreement.

Karl concluded by mentioning that the City and County of El Paso have a contractual relationship, the county should be invited to become part of the JAC.

Dr. Dubois also mentioned the need to invite the Ysleta del Sur Pueblo and have them hold a seat in the JAC.

Mark Hansen suggested convening the Statues and Procedures Subcommittee of the JAC to work on this issue and have a proposal for the next JAC meeting. He charged Carlos Rincon with this task.

El Paso Conceptual Ozone Transport plan. *David Dubois, NMSU*

This ozone study will be developed by NMSU and St. Edwards University, aimed to characterize the physicochemical processes that give rise to ozone, to know how it is formed, where it originates and its precursors. To this end ozone will be measured to characterize the process of formation, dispersion and destruction through a compilation of historical data from monitors and by using weather balloons and meteorological data.

A review of the data of ozone compartment shows that El Paso is affected by regionally transported and local sources.

The project will take place in summer 2017. Funding for this project will be provided by the TCEQ through the Metropolitan Planning Organization of El Paso, Texas. 2B sensor technology will be used to measure ozone.

Dr. Dubois requested support from the JAC to identify the best sites for the study and for obtaining the necessary permits for the installation of instruments.

Currently the terms of reference and scope of work for the study have been sent to the MPO.

Mark Hansen asked at how many locations monitors will be installed. The answer was that it is not yet known with certainty. There may be four to five sites, giving priority to those where no prior measurements have been taken.

Gerardo Tarín asked if some instruments will be installed on the Mexican side in Ciudad Juárez. The answer was yes, with support from Dr. Juan Pedro Flores of UACJ, part of the study will be undertaken in Juárez; the municipality will also be involved. At the present time Dr. Dubois has an analyzer installed at UACJ as part of this collaborative effort.

Pro Aire Chihuahua. Alfredo Ruiz, SEDUE

Mr. Alfredo Ruiz gave a brief reported on the events and people involved in the development of the ProAire (comparable to a SIP in the U.S.) for the State of Chihuahua. The document was formally presented during a press event on September 6, attended by government officials, the ProAire core committee members, and guests.

Alfredo Ruiz highlighted the collaboration and participation of different government entities, academia, chambers of commerce, industry, and civil society. He also thanked Carlos Rincon of EPA for his support in the development of this important program, as well as Brenda Rios Prieto, SEMARNAT Delegate in Chihuahua, and Ana Patricia Martinez of SEMARNAT's General Directorate of Air Quality Management and Emissions and Pollutant Transfer Registry (DGGCARETC, in Spanish) for their contribution to the development of this document.

The Chihuahua ProAire was the result of the work of more than 80 stakeholders, many of them specialists in the field, in almost 30 working meetings held in Ciudad Juárez and Ciudad Chihuahua. The meetings were coordinated by the Ministry of Urban Development and Ecology (SEDUE) by the creation of two core committees: The Northern Border Committee for the northern municipalities of the state, and the South Center Committee for the south central region of the state.

The ProAire was developed in different stages. First, the group developed an evaluation of the study area, then measures were determined. Measures came from work of and at six strategic areas: mobile sources; area sources and point sources, as well as cross-cutting areas related to health protection, environmental education and communication, and institutional strengthening.

Thereafter, the Chihuahua ProAire will be the document and the regulatory framework for what to do in the state to prevent and control air pollution.

There are 20 different measures in the ProAire. For example, one is related to prescribe burning in the municipality of Cuauhtémoc municipality where the agricultural valley crop 50,000 hectares annually and

once yields are harvested the crop residue is burned to leave clean fields. This causes serious air pollution problems that affect the health of the same producers, especially the Mennonites and those in neighboring communities. The residues could be used as food for livestock, mixed with molasses. Although this usage turns out to be a bit more expensive, producers must consider it in their productions costs.

Other measures are related to removal of river bed materials due to chaotic way of mining currently performed. With the publication of an Ordinance within the Organic Law of the State, the regulation of these activities will be greatly improved.

Finally, there are measures related to vehicle emissions inspections. One of them being that within three years. A state-wide vehicle emissions inspections will be expanded to include municipalities in the rest of the state.

Ciudad Juárez Air Monitoring Network. César Díaz, Ciudad Juárez Ecology Department

César Díaz, Director of the Ecology Department of Ciudad Juárez reported on recent activities to solve the problems of the monitoring stations, among them the creation of a sustainable funding source, with five pesos from the cost of each vehicle inspection, to go towards the cost of operation and maintenance of the monitoring stations.

TCEQ monitoring technicians in El Paso also trained Ciudad Juárez personnel on air quality by TCEQ monitoring staff. Ecología Juárez technicians visited TCEQ headquarters in Austin to have better an improved exchange of communication and understanding of the monitoring network.

A private air monitoring company, “Sutron Environmental”, visited Ciudad Juárez to assess and calibrate Juárez monitoring network equipment and developed a report which averred that the stations operate properly, requiring only the acquisition of flow pumps and a review of the operation of the meteorological sensors.

CIMAV already installed the data acquisition software which is compatible with the interface developed by INECC, so there will be no problem acquiring the data and sharing it with INECC and other institutions, including the TCEQ and EPA.

César Díaz especially thanked Carlos Rincon, SEMARNAT, TCEQ, and other players who made this possible.

Mark Hansen congratulated César by acknowledging the great work undertaken to keep the monitoring network going and to TCEQ for the providing their contractor and for all the support they provided to Ciudad Juárez.

Summary of Evaluations from JAC Meeting May 12. Eddie Moderow, TCEQ

Eddie Moderow opened his presentation with a joke, “Federal colleagues, ask not what the JAC can do for you, but what you can do for the JAC.”

In the May 12 meeting held in El Paso participants received four questions to learn the opinion of members and the public on the work of the JAC. All of these will be posted on the JAC website. The questions were: What do you like about the JAC? One person answered, “making connections in my local community and improving air quality”. Other answers were: “creating synergies”, “creating networks and exchanging information,” regarding air quality.

1. What are the next steps from your perspective?

What can we improve about the JAC? Last time, there were problems with the simultaneous interpretation and this time it appears to be fixed. One person asked presenters to make presentations in both languages, improve the interpretation, and make presentations available to attendees after the meeting. Other responses were to “reinvigorate the technical committees”, reengage private sector companies to participate in the JAC and to involve the health services community and have a health component.

In response to, “what are the next steps?” answers included: “Influence public policy, make suggestions to the air policy forum, the Juárez monitoring network, and working together to help address solutions for the new ozone standard, and to “get the JAC website back up”., obtain data, academic research, and have the monitoring network on the web page. Eddie announced that by the next JAC meeting the website should be up and running.

The interpretation technology today with ZipDX for remote participants and GoToMeeting are technologies to improve, makes it easier to meet and to maintain a close connection.

Several years ago the State University of New York did a study on the JAC entitled, *Mitigating Cross Border Air Pollution: The Power of a Network*. It is all about the successful binational cooperation and how valuable it is. Staff will post the report on the new JAC website and recommend people check it out.

Thank you for providing your comments. Thank you for submitting your comments.

Evaluations will be given yearly and will allow the evaluation of the work of the JAC, to improve air quality in this politically complicate air shed. The surveys will be published on the web page.

Requirements for JAC Meetings in Different Locations. Gina Posada, TCEQ

Gina Posada explained the reason for the proposal and states the requirements to facilitate the JAC meetings at the different locations: Doña Ana County, El Paso and Ciudad Juárez. The locations need to meet a minimum set of requirements to use the ZipDX and GoToMeeting technologies. Feedback from the JAC members was requested in regards to possible venues, or if they wished to host a meeting. She reminded them that the requirements were important when one is official host of a meeting.

Karl Rimkus asked if the requirements were necessary to host the meeting and Gina Posada said yes. Requirements include a hard wired internet connection and an IT person to provide support before and during the meetings, such as Tony Varin from Burrell College.

Karl mentioned that perhaps in hosting a meeting when the meeting is in Ciudad Juarez, those who are not crossing over the Environmental Services Department could be the alternate location since the technology is not as stringent.

Carlos Rincon mentioned the new administration in Ciudad Juárez should provide information on where they would like to host the meeting.

Comments from the Public

Mr. Carlos Simental, President of the Ciudad Juárez Vehicle Inspection Center Association, wanted to thank the JAC for the invitation to this meeting and would like to extend their support to the new Ciudad Juárez administration.

Final Comments from Co-Chairs

Mark Hansen commented that it is important to follow up and establish a work group for the motion that Karl suggested to potentially invite the county and the tribal nation to join the JAC. Carlos was assigned to lead this task.

Ana Patricia Martínez concluding comments were to keep working on the challenges with the new ozone standards and to keep working with the JAC, and the new administrations, on the ProAire.

Carlos thanked TCEQ for making this huge improvement in the meeting, and not only for the JAC but to be implemented along the entire border.

Next meeting is January 19th, 2017.